AREA 6

COST REPLACEMENT HEARING DEALER REBUTTAL EXHIBITS

April 19, 2023

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

INDEX OF REBUTTAL EXHIBITS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven,
Galliker Dairy Company,
Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Rebuttal Exhibit D1	Alexandra Deimler, CPA Curriculum Vitae
Rebuttal Exhibit D2	Processing, Packaging and Delivery Costs/Point
Rebuttal Exhibit D2-A	Cost Replacement Adjustments for Processing, Packaging and Delivery Costs
Rebuttal Exhibit D3	Summary of Current Container Costs with Adjustments for Shrinkage and Loss and Update to Current Month
Rebuttal Exhibit D3-A	Adjusted Container Costs Compared to Current Month Container Costs
Rebuttal Exhibit D4	Summary of Current Ingredient Costs
Rebuttal Exhibit D4-A	Cost Replacement Adjustments for Ingredients
Rebuttal Exhibit D5	Weighted Cost of Shrinkage and Weighted Costs and Revenues from Bulk Cream and Bulk Milk
Rebuttal Exhibit D6	Butterfat Content of Price Controlled Products
Rebuttal Exhibit D7	Cost Increases (Decreases) for Labor, Insurance and Utility Costs
Rebuttal Exhibit D8	Changes in Diesel Fuel Costs
Rebuttal Exhibit D9	Changes in Heating Fuel Costs (Natural Gas)
Rebuttal Exhibit D10	Adjustments for Container Efficiencies Due to Container Size
Rebuttal Exhibit D11A	Calculation of Minimum Wholesale Price Gallon Reduced Fat Milk (2%)
Rebuttal Exhibit D11B	Calculation of Minimum Wholesale Price Half Pint Flavored Nonfat Milk (Skim)

Alexandra Deimler, CPA Curriculum Vitae

EDUCATION

Mercyhurst University – B.A. Degree in Accounting and Finance

EMPLOYMENT

Herbein + Company, Inc., Reading, PA

2020 to present

Manager - Dairy Consulting

- Cost benchmarking
- Milk shrinkage reduction projects
- Dairy accounting seminars, including Dairy 101, for private clients and industry
- Regulatory assistance with PMMB, USDA and other state agencies
- Financial reporting for dairy businesses subject to dairy price regulation
- Dairy cost accounting for basic and complex products
- Preparation of cost replacement exhibits

MicroStrategy, Inc., Tysons Corner, VA

2019 - 2020

Internal Auditor

- Performed risk evaluations for audit areas
- Performed operational, financial, and IT compliance audits
- Drafted audit reports
- Help to implement Workiva (an audit tool)

SEK, Inc., Chambersburg, PA

2017 - 2019

Staff accountant - Audit

- Performed audits, compilations, reviews, and tax engagements
- Prepared 990s, 1065s, 1040s, 1120s, and Schedule Ks
- Summarized census data and investment activity for pension department

AJARALA Holsteins, Landisburg, PA

2001-2011

Grew up on dairy farm, milking and caring for cows and the facility

PROFESSIONAL AND CIVIC ASSOCIATIONS AND DESIGNATIONS

CPA – Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Firm Member - Allinial Global

Member – American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA)

Member – Pennsylvania Institute of Certified Public Accountants (PICPA)

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

PROCESSING, PACKAGING AND DELIVERY COSTS/POINT (WEIGHTED AVERAGE BASED ON SALES IN AREA 6)

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company,

Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Cost Center	Total 2021 Points in PMMB Area 6 (1)	O	Average 2021 t/Point (1)
Receiving, lab and field work	68,252,454	\$	0.0191
Standardization and pasteurization	82,669,100		0.0221
Bottling	81,995,243		0.0607
Cold room	89,910,590		0.0479
Delivery	84,570,213		0.1881
Selling	85,313,500		0.0192
		Ф	0.2571
		\$	0.3571

⁽¹⁾ Reflects points (and related cost/point) for sales in PMMB Area 6 for the cross-section dealers.

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

COST REPLACEMENT ADJUSTMENTS FOR PROCESSING, PACKAGING AND DELIVERY COSTS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company, Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

	2021 Weighted Average Cost/Point	2020 Cost/Point Included in Existing Order (1)	Increase (Decrease)
Receiving, lab and field work	\$0.0191	\$0.0180	\$0.0011
Standardization and pasteurization	0.0221	0.0195	0.0026
Bottling	0.0607	0.0554	0.0053
Cold room	0.0479	0.0440	0.0039
Delivery	0.1881	0.1788	0.0093
Selling	0.0192	0.0192	0.0000
Sub total	\$0.3571	\$0.3349	\$0.0222
Add: 2022 Cost increase (decrease) adjus	0.0314		
Less: 2021 Cost (increase) decrease adjus	(0.0009)		
Net change			\$0.0527

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

SUMMARY OF CURRENT CONTAINER COSTS WITH ADJUSTMENT FOR SHRINKAGE AND LOSS AND UPDATE TO CURRENT MONTH

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company,

Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Container Size	April 2022 Container Cost (1)	Adjust from April 2022 to February 2023 - Current (2)	Subtotal	Calculated Shrinkage and Loss (4)	Shrinkage Cost	Total Container Cost
Gallon (5)	\$ 0.2286	\$ 0.0057	\$ 0.2343	1.99%	\$ 0.0047	\$ 0.2390
1/2 gallon - plastic 1/2 gallon - paper 1/2 gallon - blended (5)	0.2408 (3) 0.2408	(0.0014)	0.2394	1.91%	0.0046	0.2440
Quart - plastic Quart - paper Quart - blended (5)	0.2148 0.1055 0.2140	0.0025	0.2165	1.57%	0.0034	0.2199
Pint - plastic Pint - paper Pint - blended (5)	0.1640 0.0538 0.1625	0.0021	0.1646	1.62%	0.0027	0.1673
Twelve ounce	(3)					
Ten ounce	(3)					
1/2 pint - plastic (5)	(3)	-	-	0.92%	-	-
1/2 pint - paper (5)	0.0309	0.0070	0.0379	0.85%	0.0003	0.0382
Four ounce - paper	0.0306		0.0306	1.53%	0.0005	0.0311
Dispenser	0.1386		0.1386	1.30%	0.0018	0.1404

- (1) For containers not purchased in April 2022 the most recent invoice was used.
- (2) December 2022 container costs were used by the PMMB to establish minimum resale prices for February 2023.
- (3) Container not packaged in this Area.
- (4) Calculated based on actual container loss from a state-wide cross section of processing dealers for controlled containers used during the period January March 2009. This state-wide cross section is composed of every processing dealer that participates in a cost replacement hearing.
- (5) Current container costs would replace these costs monthly when the PMMB minimum resale prices are announced.

PMMB AREA 6 APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

ADJUSTED CONTAINER COSTS COMPARED TO CURRENT MONTH CONTAINER COSTS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven,
Galliker Dairy Company,
Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Adjusted Container Container Costs in Costs from **Current Prices Container Size** Exhibit D3 **(1) Difference** Gallon (2) \$ 0.2399 \$ (0.0009) 0.2390 \$ Half Gallon (2) 0.2440 0.1872 0.0568 Quart (2) 0.2199 0.2088 0.0111 Pint (2) 0.1673 0.1762 (0.0089)1/2 pint - plastic (2) 0.0537 0.0537 1/2 pint - paper (2) 0.0005 0.0382 0.0377 Four ounce - paper 0.0311 0.0280 0.0031 Dispenser (per quart) 0.1404 0.1427 (0.0023)

⁽¹⁾ Per General Order No. A-956 (CRO 12) as updated.

⁽²⁾ These container costs to be updated monthly.

⁽³⁾ Difference between plastic ½ pint and paper ½ pint is \$0.0160. PMMB resale price schedules show the ½ pint paper price. \$0.0160 is the plastic add-on.

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

SUMMARY OF INGREDIENT COSTS (WEIGHTED AVERAGE BASED ON ACTUAL SALES IN AREA 6)

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven,
Galliker Dairy Company,
Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

	April 2022
	Ingredient
	Cost Per Pound
	(1)
Standard	\$.0000
Reduced fat (2%) milk	.0002
Low fat (1%) milk	.0002
Non fat (skim) milk	.0014
Flavored milk	.0417
Flavored reduced fat milk	.0467
Flavored nonfat milk	.0368
Buttermilk	.0330
Eggnog	.1683

⁽¹⁾ For ingredients not purchased in April 2022 the most recent invoice was used.

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

COST REPLACEMENT ADJUSTMENTS FOR INGREDIENTS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven,
Galliker Dairy Company,
Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

	2021 Weighted Average Cost/Pound	Cost/Pound included in Existing Order (1)	Increase (Decrease)
Standard milk	\$0.0000	\$0.0000	\$0.0000
Reduced fat milk (2%)	0.0002	0.0001	0.0001
Lowfat milk (1%)	0.0002	0.0001	0.0001
Nonfat milk (skim)	0.0014	0.0005	0.0009
Flavored milk (2)	0.0417	0.0407	0.0010
Flavored reduced fat milk (2)	0.0467	0.0428	0.0039
Flavored nonfat milk (2)	0.0368	0.0347	0.0021
Buttermilk	0.0330	0.0279	0.0051
Eggnog	0.1683	0.1454	0.0229

⁽¹⁾ Per General Order OGO A-956 (CRO 12) as updated for flavored milks on January 1, 2023

⁽²⁾ Ingredient costs to be updated on a quarterly basis for flavored milk, flavored reduced fat milk and flavored nonfat milk. Updates should be effective on January 1, April 1, July 1 and October 1.

PMMB AREA 6

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

WEIGHTED COST OF SHRINKAGE AND WEIGHTED COSTS AND REVENUES FROM BULK CREAM AND BULK MILK

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company, Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

PMMB Area 6		Costs	<u> </u>	Revenues	ighted Net (Revenue)	Weighted Pounds	(Rev	ghted Cost venue) Per Pound
Shrinkage	\$	563,867			\$ 563,867			
Bulk milk revenue minus milk costs Bulk milk cost center costs & freight Net bulk milk cost (revenue)		58,733		(375,887)	434,620			
Bulk cream revenue minus milk costs Bulk cream cost center costs Net bulk cream cost (revenue)		77,881		122,734	(44,853)			
Total	\$	700,481	\$	(253,153)				
Net cost (net revenue) - calendar year 20)21				\$ 953,634	129,368,116	\$	0.0074
Net cost (net revenue) in current order -	calend	dar year 202	0		\$ 560,838	130,357,259		0.0043
Net change - cost increase (cost reduction	n)				\$ 392,796		\$	0.0031

PMMB AREA 6 APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

BUTTERFAT CONTENT OF PRICE CONTROLLED PRODUCTS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven,
Galliker Dairy Company,
Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

	2021 Weighted Average Butterfat Test	Butterfat Test included in Existing Order (1)	Increase (Decrease)
Standard milk	3.2900%	3.2837%	0.0063%
Reduced fat milk (2%)	1.9031%	1.9140%	-0.0109%
Lowfat milk (1%)	0.9119%	0.9520%	-0.0401%
Nonfat milk (skim)	0.1315%	0.1246%	0.0069%
Flavored milk	3.2827%	3.2817%	0.0010%
Flavored reduced fat milk	1.1350%	1.1295%	0.0055%
Flavored nonfat milk	0.1357%	0.1529%	-0.0172%
Buttermilk	1.0145%	1.0359%	-0.0214%
Eggnog	6.5905%	6.1838%	0.4067%

⁽¹⁾ Per General Order No. A-956 (CRO 12)

PMMB AREA 6

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

COST INCREASES (DECREASES) FOR LABOR, INSURANCE AND UTILITY COSTS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company, Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

		nses for the Six	Weighted Poi Months Ende	nts for the Six d June 30 (1)	Cost Po	er Point	Increase (Decrease)
Type of Expense	2022	2021	2022	2021	2022	2021	Per Point
Labor and fringe benefits	\$11,693,029	\$ 9,891,019	43,567,919	41,136,604	\$ 0.2684	\$ 0.2404	\$0.0280
Utilities	551,751	461,738	43,567,919	41,136,604	0.0127	0.0112	0.0015
Insurance	533,398	425,657	43,567,919	41,136,604	0.0122	0.0103	0.0019
					\$0.2933	\$0.2619	\$0.0314

⁽¹⁾ Weighted based on sales in PMMB Area 6

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

CHANGES IN DIESEL FUEL COSTS

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company,

Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Diesel fuel costs – calendar year 2021 (1)	\$2,037,234
Delivery points – calendar year 2021 (1)	84,570,213
Diesel fuel cost per point delivered	\$0.0241
Average diesel price – calendar year 2021 (2)	\$3.431
Average diesel price – December 2022 (2) (3)	\$5.459
Increase (decrease) from year 2021 to month December 2022	59.11%
Increase (decrease) in diesel fuel cost per point delivered	\$0.0142

- (1) Costs of cross-section dealers weighted by sales in Area 6.
- (2) On-highway diesel prices per gallon for the Central Atlantic Region as published by the U.S. Energy Information Administration.
- (3) December 2022 diesel fuel costs were used by the PMMB in establishing minimum prices for February 2023.

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

CHANGES IN HEATING FUEL COSTS (NATURAL GAS)

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company,

Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Heating fuel costs – calendar year 2021 (1)	\$188,085
Standardization & pasteurization points – calendar year 2021 (1)	82,669,100
Heating fuel cost per point pasteurized	\$0.0023
Average heating fuel costs – calendar year 2021 (2)	\$8.34
Average heating fuel costs – October 2022 (2) (3)	12.67
Increase (decrease) from year 2021 to month October 2022	51.92%
Increase (decrease) in heating fuel cost per point pasteurized	\$0.0012

- (1) Costs of cross-section dealers weighted by sales in Area 6.
- (2) Industrial natural gas prices for Pennsylvania in dollars per thousand cubic feet as published by the U.S. Energy Information Administration.
- (3) October 2022 natural gas costs were used by the PMMB in establishing minimum prices for February 2023.

PMMB AREA 6

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

ADJUSTMENTS FOR CONTAINER EFFICIENCIES DUE TO CONTAINER SIZE

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company, Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

<u>Container Size</u>	Container Quantities Sold by Cross-Section Dealers in 2021 in Area 6	Proposed Container Efficiency <u>Adjustments</u>	Impact on Cross-Section Dealer Revenue	Container Efficiency Adjustments in Current Order (1)	Impact on Cross-Section Dealer Revenue
Gallon	6,905,883	\$ (0.1259)	\$ (869,451)	\$ (0.1013)	\$ (699,566)
Half Gallon	6,755,505	(0.0525)	(354,664)	(0.0424)	(286,433)
Quart	1,805,581	0.1095	197,711	0.1052	189,947
Pint	2,671,084	0.1377	367,808	0.1319	352,316
Half Pint	27,576,857	0.0239	659,087	0.0241	664,602
4 oz.	733,201	0.0346	25,369	0.0351	25,735
Dispenser (per quart)	826,809	(0.0305)	(25,218)	(0.0260)	(21,497)
Net impact on cross-section dealer revenues	r		<u>\$ 642</u>		\$ 225,104

⁽¹⁾ Per OGO A-956 (CRO 12) as updated.

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

CALCULATION OF WHOLESALE MINIMUM PRICE GALLON REDUCED FAT MILK (2%) FOR FEBRUARY 2023

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company,

Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

Butterfat test	Reference D6	Proposed Order 1.9031%	Current <u>Order (2)</u> 1.9140%	<u>Change</u> -0.0109%
Butterfat price as announced by PMMB Extended butterfat value	(1)	\$ 2.7608 per lb. \$ 0.0525 per lb.	\$ 2.7608 per lb. \$ 0.0528 per lb.	
Skim price as announced by PMMB Extended skim value	(1)	\$ 15.96 per cwt. \$ 0.1566 per lb.	\$ 15.96 per cwt. \$ 0.1565 per lb.	
Total milk value at announced prices		\$ 0.2091 per lb.	\$ 0.2094 per lb.	\$ (0.0003)
Ingredient cost Cost of shrinkage / bulk milk & cream Total milk cost per pound	D4 D5	0.0002 0.0074 \$ 0.2167 per lb.	0.0001 0.0043 \$ 0.2138 per lb.	\$ 0.0029
Pounds per gallon (conversion) Total milk cost per gallon		\$ 1.8680	\$ 1.8430	\$ 0.0250
Container cost (adjusted for shrinkage) Cost center costs 1st half 2022 to 1st half 2021 adjustment	D3 D2 D7	0.2390 each 1.4284 0.1256	0.2399 each 1.3396 0.0036	(0.0009) 0.0888 0.1220
Container efficiency adjustment Percentage discount adjustment	D11 (3)	(0.1259) 0.0144	(0.1013) 0.0144	(0.0246)
Diesel fuel adjustment Heating fuels adjustment	D8 D9	0.0568 0.0048	0.0852 0.0044	(0.0284)
Dealer profit at 3.4% Subtotal	(2)	\$ 3.6111 each 0.1271 \$ 3.7382 each	\$ 3.4288 each 0.1207 \$ 3.5495 each	\$ 0.1823 \$ 0.0064 \$ 0.1887
Less: average delivery cost Add: high cost delivery Wholesale minimum price	(2) (2)	(0.5640) 0.9864 \$ 4.1606 each	(0.5640) 0.9864 \$ 3.9719 each	\$ 0.1887

- (1) As announced for February 2023 by PMMB on January 20, 2023.
- (2) Per OGO A-956 (CRO 12) as updated.
- (3) Per OGO A-972 "Price Adjustments to Account for Interaction of Milk Prices and Wholesale Percentage Discounts."

APRIL 19, 2023 COST REPLACEMENT HEARING

CALCULATION OF WHOLESALE MINIMUM PRICE HALF PINT FLAVORED NONFAT MILK (SKIM) FOR FEBRUARY 2023

DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Sharpsville, DFA Dairy Brands Fluid, LLC - Schuylkill Haven, Galliker Dairy Company,

Ritchey's Dairy, Inc., Turner Dairy Farms, Valley Farms Dairy LLC

	Deference	Proposed	Current	Change
Butterfat test	Reference D6	<u>Order</u> 0.1357%	Order (2) 0.1529%	<u>Change</u> -0.0172%
Butterfat price as announced by PMMB Extended butterfat value	(1)	\$ 2.7608 per lb. \$ 0.0037 per lb.	\$ 2.7608 per lb. \$ 0.0042 per lb.	
Skim price as announced by PMMB Extended skim value	(1)	\$ 15.96 per cwt. \$ 0.1594 per lb.	\$ 15.96 per cwt. \$ 0.1594 per lb.	
Total milk value at announced prices		\$ 0.1631 per lb.	\$ 0.1636 per lb.	\$ (0.0005)
Ingredient cost Cost of shrinkage / bulk milk & cream Total milk cost per pound	D4 D5	0.0368 0.0074 \$ 0.2073 per lb.	0.0347 0.0043 \$ 0.2026 per lb.	\$ 0.0047
Pounds per gallon (conversion) Total milk cost per half pint		0.50 \$ 0.1037	0.50 \$ 0.1013	\$ 0.0024
Container cost (adjusted for shrinkage)	D3	0.0382 each	0.0377 each	0.0005
Cost center costs 1st half 2022 to 1st half 2021 adjustment	D2 D7	0.0893 0.0079	0.0837 0.0002	0.0056 0.0077
Container efficiency adjustment	(2)	0.0239	0.0241	(0.0002)
Percentage discount adjustment Diesel fuel adjustment	(3) D8	0.0009 0.0036	0.0009 0.0053	(0.0017)
Heating fuels adjustment	D6 D9	0.0030	0.0033	(0.0017) (0.0001)
2 ,		\$ 0.2677 each	\$ 0.2535 each	\$ 0.0142
Dealer profit at 3.4% Subtotal	(2)	0.0094 \$ 0.2771 each	0.0089 \$ 0.2624 each	\$ 0.0005 \$ 0.0147
Less: average delivery cost Add: high cost delivery	(2) (2)	(0.0353) 0.0617	(0.0353) 0.0617	
Wholesale minimum price		\$ 0.3035 each	\$ 0.2888 each	\$ 0.0147

- (1) As announced for February 2023 by PMMB on January 20, 2023.
- (2) Per OGO A-956 (CRO 12) as updated.
- (3) Per OGO A-972 "Price Adjustments to Account for Interaction of Milk Prices and Wholesale Percentage Discounts."